



Together for a Better World for All

Mainstreaming Disability in Development

**Together for a
Better World for All**
Mainstreaming Disability in Development



Together for a Better World for All

Mainstreaming Disability in Development

Published by



Consumer Unity and Trust Society (CUTS)
D-217, Bhaskar Marg, Bani Park, Jaipur-302016, India
Ph: +91.141.5133259, 2282821, Fx: +91.141.4015395
E-mail: cart@cuts.org
Web: www.cuts-international.org/cart

In partnership with



© CUTS, 2012

ISBN 978-81-8257-163-1

Citation: CUTS, 2012, Together for a Better World for All:
Mainstreaming Disability in Development

The material in this publication may be reproduced in whole or in part and in any form for education or non-profit uses, without special permission from the copyright holders, provided acknowledgment of the source is made. The publishers would appreciate receiving a copy of any publication, which uses this publication as a source. No use of this publication may be made for resale or other commercial purposes without prior written permission of CUTS.

Printed by: M.S. Printer, Jaipur

#1203

Contents

Acknowledgement	i
Executive Summary	iii
Introduction	1
About the Project	7
Sensitisation Workshops	11
Access Audit: Introduction, Training and Action Results	17
Publications	22
In Media	23

Acknowledgement

This intervention symbolises joining hands with Sightsavers which has immense experience in the field of disability and eye care and Consumer Unity & Trust Society which is working on development issues with the network of more than 900 grassroots CSOs/NGOs/CBOs in Rajasthan since last 28 years.

During the implementation of the project, more than 75 NGOs took part in various activities and as a result the issue of mainstreaming disability was injected in the existing agenda of these NGOs, especially in the 24 NGOs where sensitisation workshops were conducted and action plans were formulated. We are thankful to the heads and functionaries of these organisations for taking up the issue upfront.

Under this intervention lot of intense discussions and debates took place at various levels with diverse set of audiences, including subject experts on disability, officials of Department of Empowerment and Social Justice, various Persons with Disability (PwDs) who put forth their suggestions to make this intervention a platform-setting and result-oriented in nature.

This intervention would not have been successful without the expert advice of most proactive resource person Prasanna Kumar Pincha, fortunately appointed as Chief Commissioner of PwDs of India; Ketan Kothari, Regional Programme Development Adviser (Social Inclusion), Sightsavers; and Jagdish Chauhan, Programme Officer, North West Area Office, Sightsavers. The technical and expert advice of Abraham George, Area Director

and Prabhat Sinha, Programme Manager, North-West Office, Sightsavers have been instrumental in the successful implementation of this novel intervention.

We express our sincere gratitude to Prateek Agrawal, Deep Singh Rathore, Madhuri and Manoj Bharadwaj for their valuable support in conducting access audits.

This intervention has been built on the related practical experiences of Sightsavers which not only provided their support to the programme but also gave technical advices and timely support, so we thankfully acknowledge their important role in the success of the programme.

It is worthwhile to convey a big thanks to George Cheriyan, Director and Head, CUTS Centre for Consumer Action, Research and Training (CUTS CART) for his valued guidance throughout the programme implementation.

Last but not least, the project team members (Madhu Sudan Sharma and Arti Pandey Tiwari) who implemented the programme are also thankful for their efforts to make this programme a big success.

Executive Summary

Persons with disability (PwD) face numerous instances of exclusion from their family, social life, education, employment, access to basic services and are discriminated at many occasions due to their impairments. These exclusions prevail because of lack of adequate sensitisation towards disability issues and barriers existing in the society such as attitudinal, environmental and institutional.

In order to promote the overall development and break the cycle of poverty and disability, the ‘Twin-Track approach’ has been advocated. There are some challenges in the way of mainstreaming disability in development like there is lack of a proper mechanism which can enhance the quality of implementation of government policy/standards and laws to promote the rights of PwDs. There is inadequate allocation of financial resources by governments for their welfare therefore the rate of employment of PwDs is very low. On the other side the PwDs are sparsely populated and as a result they are not united to create a big vote bank for politicians, secondly they are politically highly underrepresented in the parliament and state assemblies so nobody is there who can take care of their issues in these apex law making institutions.

An Inception-cum-project Meeting was organised. It is known to all that lack of sensitisation towards the issues of disability among society, polity, service providers, NGOs, and among PwDs is a hard reality, therefore, to address this issue total 24 NGOs/ educational institutions in different districts of the state were sensitised.

It is a fact that on one side there are barriers in the government buildings and public facilities, and on other side there is strong need of removing these barriers for the sake of society as a whole. But there are potential hurdles in way. There is lack of financial resources, planning and disabled friendly design capacity in the concerned departments. There is lack of sensitisation among decision makers about the accessibility issue and cooperation between institutions. The culture of accessibility has to be developed through constructing buildings without barriers.

As an outcome of the access audit the issues were raised in the Traffic Control Board of Jaipur to make three busiest roads of Jaipur city namely Johari Bazar, Indira Bazar and Bapu Bazar barrier-free and disabled-friendly. The Traffic Department of Jaipur is taking prompt action on the submitted report and has not only reserved the parking for PwDs in the parking of *Yaadgar* building but also ordered seven other places for them in the city for reserved parking in front of various public buildings. Officials are working on the report to make the *Yaadgar* building more barrier-free and disabled-friendly.

International Day of Persons with Disability (IDPD), 2011 and 2012 were celebrated to commemorate and acknowledge the progress achieved by the PwDs in the field of social inclusion.

Under the project one brochure covering the background, and four quarterly newsletters called 'Dis-Ability Junction' were published.

Introduction

Mainstreaming Disability

‘Mainstreaming’ is a term which has gained currency in development as a way to promote gender equality, and later as a strategy for people living with HIV/AIDS. Mainstreaming is often put on a par with ‘inclusion’, especially when it comes to disability issues. There is some discussion on whether mainstreaming is the goal and inclusion the strategy, or the other way around. There is no officially accepted definition of mainstreaming disability. However, the experience with defining gender mainstreaming may provide insight about how to proceed to define it. Broadly, mainstreaming disability refers to a strategy through which concerns, needs and experiences of disabled are made an integral part/dimension of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and societal spheres, so that disabled benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated (Albert, 2005).

The persistent exclusion, at many times, fails to recognise PwDs as a human being and their rights and entitlements as a citizen of the country is overlooked. Despite being recognised as a subgroup requiring specific intervention in the ongoing development initiatives the “unintentional exclusion” continues and the natural process of social inclusion remains a challenge. Lack of awareness and sensitisation are key elements that promote the “unintentional exclusion”. The international and national laws and policies are focusing on how to minimise these barriers and thereby making the society more inclusive.

Halfway to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) target year of 2015, PwDs remain conspicuously absent from programming and discourse on achievement of goals. PwDs represent approximately 10 percent of the world's population. 80 percent of PwDs live in developing countries, and the failure to include and integrate them in all development activities will mean failure to achieve MDGs.

Efforts to incorporate and include PwDs into the development activities have been gaining momentum over the past decades. There is growing recognition among organisations engaged in the development of the need to include PwDs in development activities; however, there remains much room for expansion of such programmes. Incorporating the needs of PwDs, integrating a disability perspective into the ongoing sector and thematic programmes and adopting an integrated and inclusive approach to addressing disability is the present need.

The Convention on the Rights of PwDs also provides an opportunity for human rights and development actors to actively combine and integrate these two areas. New and innovative thinking and collaboration are required to utilise the Convention so as to bring the maximum benefit to PwDs and the society. It is both a human right and a development instrument that elucidates how all categories of rights apply to PwDs, and identifies practical measures to formulate development programmes that are inclusive of and accessible to PwDs.

Need of Mainstreaming Disability

It is a bitter fact that PwDs have been neglected through out of the history and had been kept away from the fruits of development; as a result till date they are one of the most marginalised and impoverished groups within the society and are more likely to be uneducated, unemployed, lack of access to healthcare, vulnerable to abuse and socially marginalised. They form nearly 10 percent

of the Indian population and despite being over represented among the poor; the much-talked ‘MDGs’ can be realised neither in letter nor in spirit without their socio-economic inclusion in the society. The hitherto residual treatment of disability as only a social welfare issue, it was realised, would not lead to emancipation or equality unless mainstreaming issues of disability within the broader development agenda are taken on priority basis because progress towards mainstreaming disability has not happened to be on ground to the extent desired.

Mainstreaming Disability: With a Twin Track Approach?

In order to promote the overall development and break the cycle of poverty and disability the ‘Twin-Track approach’ has been advocated. Twin track approach implies including the perspectives of PwDs in all relevant development projects, while at the same time empowering PwDs through disability-specific projects, or components of projects. Twin track approach says that supporting and empowering the PwDs, their families and representing organisations through increasing their access to support services, healthcare, education, livelihood and social activities as well as through political empowerment is essential. It also identifies and overcome the barriers in society that PwDs face, eg. physical accessibility, communication, attitude, legislation, and including all aspects of development.

Challenges in Mainstreaming Disability

- Lack of adequate government policy/standards to promote the rights of PwDs and poor implementation of existing laws
- Limited provision of relevant services
- Social discrimination and discrimination within the family
- High level of unemployment of PwDs
- Strong links between disability and poverty
- Role played by mainstream civil society organisations is inadequate

- Scattered population of PwDs, so there is lack of united voice
- PwDs are not a big vote bank for politicians
- Lack of political representation in the Parliament and state assemblies

Definitions of Impairment and Disability

‘Disability’ and ‘impairment’ are two different concepts. The distinction in definitions has gradually come about with the advance of the social model of disability.

Impairment is the physical or mental limitation a person has, so the purely factual absence of or loss of function in a body part.

Disability, on the other hand, is the limitation to a person with an impairment caused by society’s attitudes, physical environment, institutional and legal barriers. If a child cannot go to school because the steps are too high, the books are not available in Braille, the teacher and other pupils will not accept the child, or the transport to school is impossible, then that is called a disability.

Impairments can be medically classified, or treated, or provided technical aids for; disabilities cannot. To most people with a disability, the impairment is not the main problem; but disability is. Therefore, disability is what we must focus on.

Classification of Disabilities

The International Classification of Functioning, Disability, and Health (ICF) is a tool developed by the World Health Organisation (WHO) to measure health and disability (disability being defined as: “the outcome or result of a complex relationship between an individual’s health condition and personal factors, and of the external factors that represent the circumstances in which the individual lives”). This classification is important to be

able to produce reliable surveys and statistics, and therefore more information about the prevalence and impact of disability worldwide. The ICF includes not just medical impairment-related categories, but also categories about participation and environmental factors. This way, the ICF tries to find a balance between medical and rights-based discourses.

Relationship of Disability and Poverty in Developing Countries

It is generally assumed that disabled people comprise about 10 percent of the world population. This statistics was first published by the WHO in 1989. Also, according to the United Nations Development Programme 80 percent of disabled live in developing countries. The World Bank estimates that 20 percent of the world's poorest people have one or more disabilities. Poverty is both a cause and a result of being disabled. Impairment can be caused by malnutrition, bad sanitary conditions, environmental conditions, disasters, conflicts and landmines, no road safety regulations, etc. When the impairment is present, reduced access to education, employment, microfinance schemes and affordable medical treatment make poverty worse. But what we can say from experience is that disability and poverty are often closely related.

Attitudes towards Disability

Disability, as explained above, is defined by society's reaction towards impairment. Social attitudes are a particularly disabling factor. To many people, a person with impairment is in some way abnormal or wrong. People fear disability, on the one hand, because they have no idea what they should do with it; on the other hand, because they often think it is a punishment from God, a revenge of ancestors or a result of witchcraft. Often, cultural norms as well as religious beliefs can have a serious effect on the attitudes towards and self-esteem of people with a disability.

Consequently, people with impairments are denied access to education, employment, housing, sanitation, and many other essentials that they have a right to.

About the Project

Background

In order to promote the overall development and break the cycle of poverty and disability, Consumer Unity & Trust Society (CUTS) in partnership with Sight Savers sensitised and advocated for the inclusion of PwD in the main course of development with their full participation under the Project ‘Mainstreaming Disability in Rajasthan’.

Under this project entire Rajasthan was the project area and its goal was to facilitate effective and meaningful inclusion of PwDs in to larger development actions in order to achieve their full citizenship rights. The main purpose of this initiative was to sensitise and build the capacity of selected development agencies, Sightsavers partner organisations, state officials and develop human capital for promoting inclusion of disabled people and enable them to access their rights and entitlements to a life of dignity. Under the project, NGOs, educational institutes like law colleges, MSW and Rural Development institutes were targeted for sensitisation workshops. For conducting access audits government departments and their official buildings were targeted to identify and eliminate the existing barriers.

Goal

Facilitating effective and meaningful inclusion of PwDs in to larger development actions and processes at all levels and spheres in order to achieve full citizenship right

Purpose

The main purpose of this initiative was to sensitise and build the capacity of selected development agencies, Sightsavers partner organisations, state officials and develop human capital for promoting inclusion of disabled and enable them to access their rights and entitlements to a life of dignity.

Duration

The project commenced in September 2010 and concluded in December 2012. Initially the project was for one year but was extended for another six months. So the total project duration was 18 months.

Beneficiaries

The project is intended to promote inclusion of PwDs in the social development initiatives. It is expected that they are included as a focused target group by the development organisations and institutions and process of making inclusive environment in the state being accelerated. Project targets some selected developmental organisations and institutions of the state so that disability is mainstreamed at their organisational and programme



George Cheriyan, Director, CUTS delivering opening remarks at State-level Dissemination-cum-Launch meeting in Jaipur on September 01, 2010



Prasanna Kumar Pincha, Present Chief Commissioner of Persons with Disability, Government of India speaking at the Launch Meeting in Jaipur on September 01, 2010

level. Following leading organisations and institutions of the state were approached for sensitisation and upon receiving their consent through dialogue, the process of sensitisation and mainstreaming of disability was undertaken with them. CUTS being the main implementing agency in this whole process also undergone the process of mainstreaming disability within their programmes, policies and procedures.

In the project Sightsavers and their partners were made part including academic institutions running the MSW or Rural Management courses to target the budding development professionals and faculty members to orient them on the issue of disability rights, social inclusion and UNCRPD. For sensitisation workshops Law College Mass Communication institutions were also selected to sensitise the graduate students and their faculty members of Rajasthan to orient on UNCRPD and disability laws. Initially around 1500 professionals, students, faculty members and grassroots NGO workers were targeted as beneficiaries.

Objectives

- To sensitise and build the capacity of key leading NGOs including eight Sightsavers partners located in Rajasthan to facilitate the inclusion of disability as a programming dimension and inclusion of PwDs
- To sensitise the budding professionals of the development sector, law and media on the issue of disability rights and social inclusion
- To conduct access audits of selected public utilities to identify barriers with the help of subject experts and advocate for removing these barriers and make the public utility disabled friendly

Key Activities

- 24 one-day sensitisation workshops with major INGOs, NGOs, Sightsavers partners and with key government department heads in Rajasthan
- Resource pack development
- IEC materials (posters and brochure on disability)
- Access audit of 20 buildings of various organisations and government bodies
- Celebration of important days (Disability day, White cane days)

Expected Outcome

- It is envisaged that this one year project would sensitise organisations and departments on the need to include PwDs as a focus of their programming
- In case of Sightsavers partner organisations the impact would be in terms of development of HR policies and inclusion of PwDs as part of their work force

Sensitisation Workshops

Sensitisation Workshop on Mainstreaming Disability

CUTS with support of the selected partner organisations, conducted one or half day sensitisation workshops on Mainstreaming Disability with their concerned staff for enhancing their capacity regarding the issue of mainstreaming disability in Rajasthan and incorporating the inclusion of disability in their routine activities. It should also be the primary responsibility of the concerned organisation to disseminate the same at every nook and corner of their field areas.

The sensitisation workshops were conducted in total 24 NGOs/ educational institutes in different districts of the state. At first, selection of NGOs was done on the basis of the work being done by them with the community at grassroots and their willingness towards not only being a part of this programme on mainstreaming but also adopting the idea and replicating it in their respective organisations. After mutually deciding the date of sensitisation workshops a team of resource persons and facilitators visit organisations to discuss issues related to disability to equip them with the theoretical knowledge and enriching the conceptual clarity by involving participants in discussions. The 24 organisations are as follows:

S. No.	Organisations	Date
1.	<i>URMUL</i> Trust, Bikaner	October 2010
2.	<i>GRAVIS</i> , Jodhpur	November 2010
3.	IIRM, Jodhpur	November 2010
4.	CUTS CHD, Chittorgarh	January 2011
5.	<i>VAAGDHARA</i> , Banswara	January 2011
6.	Law College, Univ. of Raj., Jaipur	February 2011
7.	IIRM, Jaipur	February 2011
8.	<i>CECOEDECON</i> , Jaipur	February 2011
9.	<i>Magra Mewar Vikas Sansthan</i> , Ajmer	March 2011
10.	<i>Doosara Dashak</i> , Jaipur	March 2011
11.	<i>Seva Mandir</i> , Udaipur	April 2011
12.	<i>JJVS</i> , Udaipur	April 2011
13.	<i>ASTHA</i> , Udaipur	April 2011
14.	Alert, Udaipur	April 2011
15.	<i>SURE</i> , Barmer	April 2011
16.	<i>Barmer Mahila Mandal</i>	May 2011
17.	<i>Bodh Shiksha Samiti</i> , Alwar	August 2011
18.	<i>AMIED</i> , Alwar	August 2011
19.	<i>MMSVS</i> , Alwar	August 2011
20.	Mass Communication Centre, Univ. of Raj.	September 2011
21.	School of Social Work, Univ. of Raj. Jaipur	September 2011
22.	NGOs of Dausa district	October 2011
23.	Gram Chetana Kendra, Jaipur	October 2011
24.	<i>Nirman Sansthan Khandel</i> , Jaipur	October 2011

Outcome of the Sensitisation Workshops

- Most of the organisations agreed to take the issue of disability on priority and build capacity of staff on the issue
- Change in the human resource policy of the organisation so that PwDs get equal opportunities to serve the organisation

- PwDs are playing important role in many government schemes in which selected NGOs are involved like MNREGA as facilitators and also teaching in schools. They are also getting facilitations in MNREGA evaluation
- A separate Disability Unit was formed in the organisations for dealing with the disability issue
- Organisations started doing advocacy at their level with the government for giving access and equal opportunities to PwDs
- Awareness regarding different schemes of government meant for PwDs, through different workshops. Vocational training programmes for enhancing the skill of PwDs have been started on a regular basis by many organisations
- Teachers and students in schools and colleges were sensitised on this sensitive issue by development organisations, which resulted into admission of disabled children in the common school
- CUTS Centre for Human Development (CUTS CHD) has formed Self Help Groups of PwDs and helped them in availing loans. More than 10 people have started their own business and earning livelihood
- *Vaagdhara* has provided strong support to Right to Education Act, for ensuring quality education for blind and short sighted children between 03-14 years of age
- In '*Apno Swasthya Apno Haath Scheme*' – in which NGOs are involved – disabled are employed as health workers. Many disabled women are also attached with SHG under the Indo-Global Social Service Society (IGSSS) project

- *URMUL*, an organisation working in Bikaner has conducted trainings to increase human resource for extending support and guidance to PwDs, so that they can overcome barriers and enhance their capacity
- Meetings and workshops for sensitising government officials regarding the inclusion of disability will be organised on a regular basis at the district, block and *gram panchayat* level
- *GRAVIS*, an organisation working at Jodhpur, had made its office premises easily accessible to PwDs
- Volunteers from the organisation are also helping PwDs in getting Bus and Railway passes and also assisting them in getting disability certificates from the concerned departments
- *Sewa Mandir*, Udaipur has provided financial assistance to the volunteers and the disabled members of the family for availing medical facilities



Prasanna Kumar Pincha addressing at IIRM, Jaipur



Prasanna Kumar Pincha sensitising students at Law College, Jaipur



Sensitisation workshop at AMIED, Alwar



Sensitisation workshop at MMSVS, Beawar, Ajmer



Sensitisation workshop at Doosra Dashak, Pushkar, Ajmer



Sensitisation workshop at Bodh Shiksha Samiti, Alwar

Access Audit: Introduction, Training and Action Results

Definition

Accessibility: In common language the meaning of accessibility is the ability to reach, understand, or approach something or someone. In laws and standards on accessibility, it refers to what the law requires for compliance.

Barriers: Barrier in accessibility is an object, which could be physical or immaterial, that obstructs or impedes accessibility. Barriers break the travel chain and limits mobility. It affects public safety and makes a building or facility user unfriendly. Barriers may cause accidents and lead to frustration if the user fails to pass through the hurdles in the building.

Training on Access Audit

During the planning process of conducting access audits it was underlined that only few people in Rajasthan are familiar with the process of conducting or using the tool of access audit. So it was decided to organise a Training of Trainers (ToT) on the process of access audit on November 29, 2010 so that a pool of access auditors can be created and at the same time project team can also enhance its knowledge about the same to carry out activities effectively. The ToT was followed with an access audit of *Shiksha Shankul* building on November 30, 2010. The details of ToT for better understanding are as under.



↑ Vijay Laxmi Bishnoi, Chairperson, Social Welfare Board, Government of Rajasthan speaking at International Day for Persons with Disability (IDPD) 2011 ↴



It was aimed to create a pool of resource persons on access audit in Rajasthan so that they can be used whenever such audits are required. During the training, a day was fixed for conducting a full fledge access audit of a building which has huge campus so that participants can learn the art of access audit. More than 15 participants including two resource persons, Anil Mudgal and Rohit from ARUSHI, Bhopal attended the training. In the ToT,

representatives from SURE, Barmer; URMUL Trust, Bikaner; CUTS CHD, Chittorgarh; selected PwDs having locomotor and visual impairment took part. Few people working for the cause of disability including staff of CUTS CART, Jaipur and North East Area office of Sightsavers also participated.

Access Audit Conducted

1. *Shiksha Shankul, Jaipur*
2. *Yaadgar Building, Jaipur*
3. *Sindhi Camp Bus Stand, Jaipur*
4. *Collectorate Building Chittorgarh*

Outcome of Access Audits

- CUTS CART and DCP (Traffic), Rajasthan Police conducted the access audit of different public utilities building for making them more accessible and disabled friendly. On the basis of the recommendations submitted, some possible structural changes has also started taking place.



Access Audit at Shiksha Sankul Building, Jaipur

- As an outcome of the access audit, issues were raised in the Traffic Control Board of Jaipur to make three busiest roads of Jaipur city namely Johri Bazar, Indira Bazar and Bapu Bazar barrier-free and disabled-friendly.
- The Traffic Department of Jaipur is taking prompt action on the submitted report and has not only reserved the parking for PwDs in the parking of *Yaadgar* building but also passed orders for seven other places in the city for reserved parking in front of various public buildings. Officials are working on the report to make the *Yaadgar* building more barrier-free and disabled friendly.
- Other places where access audits were conducted some action has been initiated by concerned authorities to make the buildings accessible to PwDs.

Interventions for Mainstreaming

- Inception-cum-project Meeting was organised. It is known to all that lack of sensitisation towards the issues of disability among society, polity, service providers, NGOs, and among PwDs is a hard reality, therefore, to address this issue total 24 NGOs/educational institutions in different districts of the state were sensitised
- International Day of Persons with Disability (IDPD), 2010 and 2011 were celebrated to commemorate and acknowledge the progress achieved by the PwDs in the field of social inclusion
- Conducting Street plays for further sensitising the common man about the issue of social inclusion
- Organising state level consultation involving policymakers, representatives from prominent CSOs, activists, rapporteurs, PwDs and media
- Organised sensitisation workshops at 24 different organisations working in varied field of Rajasthan

- Circulating project findings, news, reports, quarterly publications to wider level through printed newsletters and webpage
- Advocating for making the building of public utilities accessible for the PwDs through access audit and physical demonstration by the team comprising people with different types of disabilities



Aditi Mehta, Principal Secretary & Commissioner, Disability,
Government of Rajasthan at IDPD 2010

Publications





ISBN 978 81 8257 163 1



9 788182 157163 1



CUTS Centre for Consumer Action, Research & Training (CUTS CART)
D-217, Bhaskar Marg, Bani Park, Jaipur 302016
Ph: 91-141-2282821, 5133259; Fax: 91-141-2282485, 4015395
Email: cart@cuts.org; Website: www.cuts-international.org/cart